

1. One of the oldest and most famous propositions in logic is the demonstration of *Modus Ponens* often attributed to Aristotle:

i) All men are mortal.

ii) Socrates is a man.

iii) Socrates is mortal.

(a) Formalize each statement in first-order logic.

$$\begin{aligned} \forall x \bullet \text{man}(x) &\Rightarrow \text{mortal}(x) \\ \text{man}(\text{Socrates}) & \\ \text{mortal}(\text{Socrates}) & \end{aligned}$$

(b) Prove that (iii) is true given (i) and (ii).

$$\begin{array}{ll} \text{man}(x) \Rightarrow \text{mortal}(x) & [1: \text{given (clausal form)}] \\ \text{man}(\text{Socrates}) \Rightarrow \text{mortal}(\text{Socrates}) & [2: \forall\text{-inst on (1)}] \\ \text{man}(\text{Socrates}) & [3: \text{given}] \\ \text{mortal}(\text{Socrates}) & [\text{mp on (2), (3)}] \end{array}$$

2. The Drinker's Paradox, popularized Raymond Smullyan, can be stated as "There is someone in the pub such that, if that person is drinking, then everyone in the pub is drinking."

(a) State the Drinker's Paradox formally.

$$\exists x \bullet \text{drinking}(x) \Rightarrow (\forall y \bullet \text{drinking}(y))$$

(b) Prove that the Drinker's Paradox is a tautology.

By contradiction:

$$\begin{array}{ll} \neg \exists x \bullet \text{drinking}(x) \Rightarrow (\forall y \bullet \text{drinking}(y)) & [1: \text{negation of given}] \\ \forall x \bullet \neg (\text{drinking}(x) \Rightarrow (\forall y \bullet \text{drinking}(y))) & [2: \text{qf on (1)}] \\ \forall x \bullet \text{drinking}(x) \wedge \neg (\forall y \bullet \text{drinking}(y)) & [3: \text{def implies, dm on (2)}] \\ \forall x \bullet \exists y \bullet \text{drinking}(x) \wedge \neg \text{drinking}(y) & [4: \text{qf on (3)}] \\ \text{drinking}(x) \wedge \neg \text{drinking}(s(x)) & [5: \text{clause + skolem on (4)}] \\ \text{drinking}(k) \wedge \neg \text{drinking}(s(k)) & [6: \forall\text{-inst on (5)}] \\ \text{drinking}(s(k)) \wedge \neg \text{drinking}(s(s(k))) & [7: \forall\text{-inst on (5)}] \\ & \square \quad [\wedge\text{-elim on (6), (7); } \square\text{-intro}] \end{array}$$